VILLAGE OF BRATENAHL
10300 BRIGHTON ROAD
BRATENAHL, OHIO  44108
(216) 383-0468

PUBLIC IMPROVEMENTS COMMITTEE

OCTOBER 19, 2022
5:31 p.m.

MAYOR JOHN LICASTRO
GINA HUFFMAN
ROBERT YONCHAK
DAVID J. MATTY, ESQ.
NANCY L. MOLNAR, RPR, CLR

2

MAYOR LICASTRO:  So who's on Public
Improvements for this?

MR. YONCHAK:  Me.

3

MAYOR LICASTRO:  You and Gina.  So we
have a quorum, not that we're going to make any
motions.  We really can't.  We can make motions,
but we can't pass anything.  So let's look at
that agenda and walk through it, if you would.

5

MR. MATTY:  Mayor, if I may, if the
committee does want to make recommendations
today, we have two out of three members.  So you
don't have the chair, but you've got two members
here.  If they want to make recommendations on
Resolution 1274 and 1275, if they're in concert,
they can do that so that those can pass, at least
be put on first reading, but we already have the
committee's recommendation in advance.

7

MAYOR LICASTRO:  Okay.  That's great.

8

As you know, we have a yearly asphalt repair
program and we also do sidewalks and catch
basins.  Dave Maund and Don Bierut spent
considerable time discussing these particular
programs as well as the repaving of Bratenahl
Road.

11

As I said last month, the bids we got on

3

1  Bratenahl Road exceeded our estimates by a
2  substantial margin.  We're going to address that
3  in calendar year 2023.  Hopefully asphalt prices
4  will have come down by then and we can address
5  it.  In the meantime, these two projects I
6  encourage you to consider going forward.
7  Resolution 1274 reflects the bids we got
8  on the paving.  As you can see, Chagrin Valley
9  Paving was over 60,000, Infinity Paving was
10  49,632.  And it is on -- it's the latter we're
11  recommending for you to consider.
12  So Bob and Gina, any questions on that?
13  So this is various sections on Lakeshore
14  Boulevard, Bratenahl Road, Burton Avenue, and
15  Lakeshore Drive.  And they were marked and both
16  the Engineer and our Street Commissioner, Mr.
17  Maund, have them earmarked for paving.  Now, I
don't know what we're going to do.  We might have
18  to have a special meeting, because we can't pass
19  pay claims.  I don't know.  But we'd like to get
20  these done before end of calendar year.  I think
21  we have a little bit of a window.  I'll get back
22  to you on that.
23  Gina, any questions on this?
24
25

4

Chairwoman Burke-Jones, I just want to make sure
that my colleague on this committee wants to
decide if we want to hold the minutes for when
she gets back.

2

MAYOR LICASTRO:  Would someone make a
motion to recommend to Council?

3  MS. HUFFMAN:  So I will make a motion to
recommend accepting the bid of Infinity Paving

for the 2022 asphalt repair program.

MR. BENJAMIN: Can I ask a question or two?

MS. HUFFMAN: Yeah.

MR. BENJAMIN: So do we happen to have, you know based on last year, last year's bids versus this year's bids the percentage, do you know the percentage of the cost increase in asphalt?

MAYOR LICASTRO: I can tell you regarding Bratenahl Road. It went from $140 a cubic yard to like four hundred and some dollars.

MR. McDONALD: Over a period of one year?

MAYOR LICASTRO: Over one year because of oil prices. Now, this isn't a whole lot of asphalt. Bratenahl Road is a mill and fill, but these repairs, so we graded them from most needed to least. These all come under the heading of most needed.

MR. BENJAMIN: Okay.

MAYOR LICASTRO: So I know perhaps if you're driving at maybe the price will be cheaper next year. We have to do some of this every year just to maintain our roads.

MR. BENJAMIN: I have a big project, the standard milling out a section, a 10-foot, 15-foot section square foot section and then repaving it.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Yeah, they pretty much doing it in a day or two. It's pretty quick. Again, to stop them from deteriorating further, hopefully the committee can recommend it to Council for approval.

MR. BENJAMIN: And it was apples to apples with Infinity and Agresta, because Infinity came in $11,000 under. I'm assuming it is.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Under the same sections, absolutely, yeah. I mean, look at so we did Bratenahl Road. Knowing the estimate was 92,000, one company bid 160. Why even bother?

MR. BENJAMIN: Because they don't need the work.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Obviously. They know we can't exceed 10 percent of our estimate.

MR. BENJAMIN: Right.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Both were apples to apple comparisons.

MR. BENJAMIN: Thank you.
1 locking in a lower bid estimate on concrete is a
2 good thing.
3 MAYOR LICASTRO: Gina, any questions?
4 MS. HUFFMAN: I don't have any
5 questions.
6 MAYOR LICASTRO: Does someone want to
7 make a motion to recommend, please.
8 MR. YONCHAK: I'll make a motion to
9 recommend the approval of Resolution 1275 to
10 Council, accepting a bid of CA Agresta
11 Construction for the 2022 sidewalk and catch
12 basin repair work.
13 MR. McDONALD: Second.
14 MR. YONCHAK: She has to second.
15 MR. McDONALD: Sorry.
16 MS. HUFFMAN: I'll second.
17 MAYOR LICASTRO: All in favor?
18 MS. HUFFMAN: Aye.
19 MR. YONCHAK: Aye.
20 MAYOR LICASTRO: We some time to kill
21 before Tom's finance meeting. So if I may, I
22 sent you an email. We were approved by the
23 County Council for our request for ARPA funds to
24 the tune of about $250,000, a portion of which
25 will be used to pay our half of the Eddy Road

10

1 project, which is already on a 50/50 grant from
2 the county as well, so we'll use money to pay our
3 50 percent. We're going to purchase two police
4 vehicles, which are on hold for us from a company
5 out of Iowa.
6 And I want to thank Keith. His
7 relationship with representative Cheryl Stephens.
8 It was very helpful. I talked with Cheryl
9 yesterday. She was thrilled to make the funds
10 available. In fact, when Don Bierut, the Chief
11 and Lieutenant and I went to make a presentation
12 to the committee of the County Council, we saw
13 Mr. Benjamin there wearing a different hat making
14 a presentation for funds for South Euclid,
15 correct?
16 MR. BENJAMIN: Correct.
17 MAYOR LICASTRO: Was South Euclid
18 successful as well?
19 MR. BENJAMIN: Absolutely.
20 MAYOR LICASTRO: That's good. We'll see
21 it on first reading. I'm sorry, second reading.
22 We put it on for first reading last month,
23 because the County Council had yet to approve the
24 funds. So they've now been approved and signed
25 by the county executive. If we had a full

12

1 facilitator. Address the committee.
2 MR. OREL: Okay. So it's an old story
3 again. I'm probably beating a dead horse, but I
4 don't know if this committee can -- I know the
5 Mayor has been talking about an ad hoc committee
6 to look at the building that hasn't gone through.
7 No offense, Mr. Mayor, but it's been
8 eight months. This committee --
9 MAYOR LICASTRO: It's not been that
10 long, but go ahead.
11 MR. OREL: Well, since April.
12 MAYOR LICASTRO: Proceed.
13 MR. OREL: So as the Mayor said, there
14 aren't any emergencies, I guess, that can --
15 depending how you define emergencies, but there
16 are things that are urgent and that when they go,
17 they are going to go fast and they will become
18 emergencies.
19 The boiler as an example, it just --
20 it's using -- in the last season, it used 284
21 gallons of makeup water in one season. It should
22 only be using 20. We already know there are
23 leaks. Fresh water means fresh oxygen. Fresh
24 oxygen means rust. The pipes are rusting. The
25 boiler is only, I think, eight to 10 years old.
Its like life expectancy is 25 years. That is now diminished because there's so much rust in the boiler, so much fresh water coming in.

We don't know what this building is really going to need yet. I really, really -- we really need to find that out. I don't know if this committee can do it or if this committee wants to form a subcommittee to do it, but we need to know what this building needs.

Otherwise, the other shoe is going to drop and we're going to be hurting.

I mean, it's going to be a big bill somewhere down the line. There's going to be a big bill that we're not going to be prepared for because nobody's looked into it. So this is my last bloviation on this. I'm getting tired of it. So it's up to you guys. You guys, if you want to do it, if you guys don't want to do it, it's in your court, that's all.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Mr. Orel, Mr. Maund and Mr. Brown did look at the building. Some of your recommendations just are not economically feasible at this time. We just had the boiler inspection late last week. And I'll circle back to Mr. Maund to see, indeed, if the leaking you saw was supposed to get back?

As far as big projects, the ad hoc committee is going to be dealing with this in a definitive manner. I plan to convene it right after the November election. That's really taking a lot of my time, as it should. So hopefully it will give us answers long-term for this building so we know what to spend, if we spend anything, to go forward, but I know they looked at the boiler with a fine-tooth comb and will report back to Council.

MR. OREL: Actually, they don't. I worked with Gary Gill. I can do steam inspections myself. And I can tell you it leaks. What I'm telling you about 284 gallons a season is outrageous. It's too much fresh water. It's rotting the return pipes.

MAYOR LICASTRO: I'm not debating that with you, sir, but the boiler inspector looked at it.

MR. OREL: That's the state inspector. I talked with Mr. Maund about it and the refracturing is actually falling down. I got a picture of it. So there are other issues, yes.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Well, certainly the boiler has to last through the winter at least.

We'll look at that and take into consideration your concern about the leaks. Thank you.

MS. HUFFMAN: I have a comment.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Please.

MS. HUFFMAN: Mr. Orel, you and I have actually had conversations about the building.

And some of the ideas that you have as to the usage or what should be done with this building just as I have, just as a lot of people have, I think we're at the point that -- and I'll say it again, it's time for some hard conversations about this building.

If the water is not fresh enough, if there are boiler issues that are happening, then there should be additional conversations not just about saving the building, but closing the building. And I said it. I am tired of kicking the can around about this. It needs to be said so that we can come to some solution about what we want to do with it.

We continue to -- we continue to go back and forth about what's wrong with the building.

We haven't gotten a response about the ADA ruling, is it Diana, I'm sorry, who is it that Molnar Reporting Services, LLC          (440) 340-6161

MAYOR LICASTRO: It's not going to happen. If it would have happened, they would have told us by now.

Ms. Huffman, that was before we decided to let the levy expire. Going into the rec fund and taking out 50 or $60,000 at this point doesn't seem reasonable to me. At this point in time, if we would have been approved, we would have already known.

MS. HUFFMAN: All right. So that's a dead issue. But I don't think that it is prudent for us to continue to go on back and forth about the issues with the building. It's time for us to start looking at the solution for the building. And that's what I would like to talk about. If it is a desire for the community to keep the building, then we need to decide how we're going to fund it.

And the Village proper doesn't have all the money that is needed to fund what is needed.

So we need to come up with other ways to do it. If the consensus is that we want to keep the building, we're going to have to figure out where the money is needed to fund what is needed.

We're going to fund it.

I mean, it's going to be a big bill somewhere down the line. There's going to be a big bill that we're not going to be prepared for because nobody's looked into it. So this is my big bill that we're not going to be prepared for.

Otherwise, the other shoe is going to drop and we're going to be hurting.

So we need to come up with other ways to do it. We don't know what this building is really going to need yet. I really, really -- we really need to find that out. I don't know if this committee can do it or if this committee wants to form a subcommittee to do it, but we need to know what this building needs.

If the water is not fresh enough, if there are boiler issues that are happening, then there should be additional conversations not just about saving the building, but closing the building. And I said it. I am tired of kicking the can around about this. It needs to be said so that we can come to some solution about what we want to do with it.

We continue to -- we continue to go back and forth about what's wrong with the building.

We haven't gotten a response about the ADA ruling, is it Diana, I'm sorry, who is it that Molnar Reporting Services, LLC          (440) 340-6161
1. I have myself spoken to members of the Rec Commission and members who have an affinity, friends of the community center. And I have given out ideas and nobody's moved on anything.

2. I, too, feel like I would like this building to have some life in the community, but it needs its rebirth. It needs a proper rebirth, not a shoring up of a wall. That is not suitable.

3. So I would just like in future sessions when we have a Public Improvements discussion or whatever kind of discussion it is, that we come up with solutions. Yes, if the boiler doesn't work or it doesn't meet a requirement that is going to be suitable moving forward in the future, let's talk about how to fund it. That's what I want to talk about. So those are my comments.

4. MAYOR LICASTRO: Ms. Huffman, let me make something clear. The ad hoc committee will come up with a definitive recommendation about keeping it, upgrading it, tearing it down, whatever. We've been talking about it for 20 years. I'm going to put a lot of my effort, along with six or eight others that will come forward, to make a determination once and for all. I couldn't agree with something for Council to consider for this building once and for all. I couldn't agree with it.

5. So basically that's my point.

6. There are no other communities, period, that do this. A person can literally lose their home.

7. Those prices --

8. MR. OREL: Mark, for the record, talking about sewer. So the fact it's kind of related, if the committee doesn't object, let's hear what he has to say.

9. MR. OREL: Well, Council got my letter, correct?

10. MR. BENJAMIN: Yes, we did get your email.

11. MR. OREL: So basically that's my point.
It's been on the books for generations. Predates me. I did not develop this policy.

There's no need to open the street. Little more effort the blockage is released and they either reach a blockage, they call, you know, it's in the lateral. And usually with a little more effort the blockage is released and there's no need to open the street.

The logic was that almost every community, if not all communities, makes the homeowner maintain and repair and replace their sidewalk. Moreover, they burden the homeowner with keeping the sidewalk clear of snow in the wintertime. Bratenahl might be the only community that does that for the resident.

We're just about to approve the sidewalk repair and replacement program, which is, again, unique in the area. And as you know, we plow the sidewalks and keep them clear of snow in the wintertime. So the logic was since it's so rare for there to be an open cut to repair a sewer, the tradeoff affecting almost every resident is to repair a sidewalk and do snowplowing in lieu of taking the sewer just to the right-of-way.

Now, that's been a longstanding policy.

Mr. Matty, do you have any comment on this?

The Mayor's presentation of Bratenahl policy is that the resident is responsible for the sewer all the way to the connection to the main. And I wanted you to hear that, because I know your organization is in a number of communities.

The Mayor's presentation of Bratenahl repairing sidewalks and doing snowplowing, I don't know how many communities that you're in actually do snowplowing and repair sidewalks.

The communities that I am in do not do either one of those, but your organization is in quite a few communities. I don't know if you want to comment on that.

MR. BIERUT: Yeah, I can comment. I'm in three other communities aside from Bratenahl, and none of them do sidewalks. They certainly don't plow sidewalks. If they repair sidewalks, it's with some participation from resident. It's usually put on their taxes or they can pay upfront or they get a private contractor, but the resident is responsible for the sidewalks.

I don't know of any our 19 that do any snowplowing of sidewalks. Maybe one community after a long time is repairing the walks for the program to do some -- it's a program that's basically for the residents, but it's really rare that that's the case. It just isn't
25

MAYOR LICASTRO: How about maintenance of the sewer to the main?

MR. BIERUT: Out of the four I'm in, I think two are Bratenahl and another one is out to the main. Another one is handled by Cuyahoga County, so it doesn't really come in play. And the fourth maybe the resident is responsible for the clean out basically to the sidewalk.

MAYOR LICASTRO: So, Don, you've been engineer here for a dozen years?

MR. BIERUT: Longer than that.

MAYOR LICASTRO: How many times have there been an open cut sewer repair in your memory?

MR. BIERUT: Half dozen maybe, and that's from 2005.

MAYOR LICASTRO: I thought it was less than that.

MR. BIERUT: It may be less than that.

I'm shooting from the hip. Certainly less than that if you take out related to a road project, you know, like we did Lake Shore a few years ago.

MAYOR LICASTRO: I was just talking about a sewer repair that necessitated an open cut. It covers, you know, the replacement of a main, the lateral.

MR. BIERUT: Yes, to all of that. Under most of the streets. Sometimes it's under the street, sometimes it's under the tree lawn.

MR. YONCHAK: Can someone tell us where it is throughout the Village? Is there a map that tells us?

MR. BIERUT: Yes.

MR. YONCHAK: I'd like to see that.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Almost all the sewers on Lakeshore Boulevard are under Lakeshore Boulevard. Some of the side streets get a little squirrely. We occasionally have the sewer underneath there.

MR. YONCHAK: Just a question, is the main under all the streets of Bratenahl or just certain streets of Bratenahl? Is it understood?

MAYOR LICASTRO: Not the main, the lateral.

MR. BIERUT: The lateral going to the main out to the street. I think that I understand your concern. I appreciate you bringing it up. And let's look into the benefits and the challenges and re-evaluate. The way it is now at the end of the day may be the best way, but let's look at it at the costs and the estimates and examine it.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Certainly a policy has been in place for probably 50 or 60 years. I don't think anyone wants to change that policy off the cuff today, but giving it a closer look to determine actually how many times there's been an open cut, et cetera, is something that's worthwhile.

Any other comments on that? Mr. Yonchak.

MAYOR LICASTRO: The lateral going to the main out to the street. I think that I understand your concern. I appreciate you bringing it up. And let's look into the benefits and the challenges and re-evaluate. The way it is now at the end of the day may be the best way, but let's look at it at the costs and the estimates and examine it.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Certainly a policy has been in place for probably 50 or 60 years. I don't think anyone wants to change that policy off the cuff today, but giving it a closer look to determine actually how many times there's been an open cut, et cetera, is something that's worthwhile.

Any other comments on that? Mr. Yonchak.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Almost all the sewers on Lakeshore Boulevard are under Lakeshore Boulevard. Some of the side streets get a little squirrely. We occasionally have the sewer underneath there.

MR. YONCHAK: Can someone tell us where it is throughout the Village? Is there a map that tells us?

MR. BIERUT: Yes.

MR. YONCHAK: I'd like to see that.

MAYOR LICASTRO: The lateral going to the main out to the street. I think that I understand your concern. I appreciate you bringing it up. And let's look into the benefits and the challenges and re-evaluate. The way it is now at the end of the day may be the best way, but let's look at it at the costs and the estimates and examine it.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Certainly a policy has been in place for probably 50 or 60 years. I don't think anyone wants to change that policy off the cuff today, but giving it a closer look to determine actually how many times there's been an open cut, et cetera, is something that's worthwhile.

Any other comments on that? Mr. Yonchak.
lateral if it had to.

MR. OREL: That probably doesn't include --

MAYOR LICASTRO: Mr. Orel, again, we're not talking about the main.

MR. BENJAMIN: I'm sorry, I keep saying main. I meant the lateral from the house to the main.

MAYOR LICASTRO: You have to get around sewer to speak the lingo. We broached this topic, it's been discussed. We're going to move to a different topic.

MR. OREL: I would like to respond. I mean, this was my letter, I would like to have a final say on this.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Sure.

MR. OREL: Thank you. Even though it is a once-in-a-lifetime event, the fact that a person can lose their property because of it, I mean, that just blows me away. And everybody I've talked to, all the homeowners I've talked to find it insane that this is the case. And most people don't know. You're exactly right. You're exactly right. Most people do not know that they are liable for this. And I would strongly urge you got supplemental, that cover roots, damage from roots, which is mostly what it is.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Ms. Meade?

MAYOR LICASTRO: Ms. Meade?

MS. MEADE: Good.

MAYOR LICASTRO: I'm always volunteering for things.

MS. HUFFMAN: The Mayor has talked to me.

To Gina's point about the community center and to the Mayor's point about having an ad hoc committee, I don't know, to me, it would make sense based on what Gina was saying that she should have some representation on that committee as well to help represent if there's some financial possible solutions.

To Gina's point about the community center and to the Mayor's point about having an ad hoc committee, I don't know, to me, it would make sense based on what Gina was saying that she should have some representation on that committee as well to help represent if there's some financial possible solutions.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Don can look at that as well. He has contacts with Northeast Regional Sewer.

MR. BENJAMIN: Cleveland Water and Dominion both offer a sewer line and waterline.

MR. OREL: But not the roots. Not due to roots. If you read it, it's not due to roots. MAYOR LICASTRO: Thank you, Mr. Orel.

So can we close Public Improvements? Is that okay?

MAYOR LICASTRO: That's why they're so unusual. Roots can usually be -- I mean, they're wood, they can be ground down, but if it's where the sewer has a disconnect or there's been a crack in the pipe, that's when they have to have an open cut which is why they're so rare. Continue, please.

MS. MEADE: My only point was if they're roots from tree lawn and the Village planted the trees in the tree lawns that are creating -- that are part of that problem, then I don't know what kind of liability the Village might have. That was that point.

To Gina's point about the community center and to the Mayor's point about having an ad hoc committee, I don't know, to me, it would make sense based on what Gina was saying that she should have some representation on that committee as well to help represent if there's some financial possible solutions.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Don can look at that as well. He has contacts with Northeast Regional Sewer.

MR. BENJAMIN: Cleveland Water and Dominion both offer a sewer line and waterline.

MR. OREL: But not the roots. Not due to roots. If you read it, it's not due to roots. MAYOR LICASTRO: Thank you, Mr. Orel.

So can we close Public Improvements? Is that okay?

MAYOR LICASTRO: Don can look at that as well. He has contacts with Northeast Regional Sewer.

MR. BENJAMIN: Cleveland Water and Dominion both offer a sewer line and waterline.

MR. OREL: But not the roots. Not due to roots. If you read it, it's not due to roots. MAYOR LICASTRO: Thank you, Mr. Orel.

So can we close Public Improvements? Is that okay?
MS. HUFFMAN: Yes.

MAYOR LICASTRO: Motion to adjourn?

MR. YONCHAK: Motion to adjourn.

MS. HUFFMAN: So moved.

MR. YONCHAK: Aye.

MS. HUFFMAN: Aye.

(Meeting adjourned at 6:07 p.m.)

~ ~ ~ ~ ~

CERTIFICATE

I, Nancy L. Molnar, do hereby certify that
as such Reporter I took down in Stenotypy all of
the proceedings had in the foregoing transcript;
that I have transcribed my said Stenotype notes
into typewritten form as appears in the foregoing
transcript; that said transcript is the complete
form of the proceedings had in said cause and
constitutes a true and correct transcript therein.

Nancy L. Molnar
Nancy L. Molnar, Notary Public
within and for the State of Ohio